

Not that *Challenge* is lacking in its own kind of vigour. Wayne Booth's 'Confessions of a Lukewarm Lawrentian' offers a marvellously honest account of a rereading by a senior critic rivalled only by Mark Spilka's bravura performance, a characteristically witty and provocative essay on 'Lawrence and the Clitoris'. Paul Delany on 'Lawrence and the Decline of the Industrial Spirit' and Alan Golding on his influence on modern American poets, carry the discussion into significant new areas. The necessary contextualising of Lawrence among his contemporaries is futhered by Janice Harris (on the 'New Woman') and Michael Squires (particularly on Dickens).

The two collections emphasise different areas of Lawrence's work. In *Challenge*, there is more on *The Rainbow*, *Women in Love* and the novellas; in *Rethinking* more on *Sons and Lovers*, *The Lost Girl*, *Mr Noon* and *Lady Chatterley's Lover*. Neither contains much on the short stories, the plays or the forms and strategies or the non-fiction, which tends to be plundered for supportive quotation rather than studied in its own right. It is a pity, for instance, that in the age of Bruce Chatwin, Jonathan Raban, Paul Theroux and Colin Thubron, no one has anything to say about Lawrence's travel books, whose extraordinary sense of interplay between the observed and the observer might usefully be compared with the work of these more recent travel writers.

Finally, critical theory. The word 'author', that supposedly dead concept, makes a posthumorous appearance in the index of *Rethinking*, principally in reference to the essay on the text of *Sons and Lovers* by Paul Eggert, who points out that structuralist and post-structuralist approaches to Lawrence tend to be baffled by the insistent authorial presence in his texts. Other new ways of reading, however, prove more fruitful. In *Challenge* both John Swift and Jane Nelson make good use of psychoanalytic theory, while Lydia Blanchard illuminates Lawrence's reading of classic American literature with the ideas of E.D.Hirsch on interpretation, and Elizabeth Wallace compares philosophies of knowledge in Lawrence and Polanyi. Bakhtin is a key figure in *Rethinking*, his concepts of monologic and dialogic fiction being used by both David Lodge and Avrom Fleishman; while Roger Fowler brings to bear on Lawrence's texts Genette's ideas about narrative discourse.

Such theory-based readings are, of course, seen by many as skirmishes in a battle of ideologies of little relevance outside the universities. Often they can be infuriatingly difficult, making opaque what seems clear or reaching familiar interpretative destinations by circuitous routes. It's a tribute to the authors and editors of both these volumes that in the essays they have collected this is not the case. Both books challenge, both rethink. Keith Brown's collection is more overtly irreverent but perhaps covers more familiar ground, while Keith

Cushman and Michael Squires have commissioned papers which explore newer dimensions. But balancing and counterbalancing could go on for ever; I can recommend both collections and would not wish to choose between books which offer so much that is thought-provoking and original.

Peter Preston

James Cowan, *D.H. Lawrence and the Trembling Balance* (University Park and London: Pennsylvania State University Press, 1990; pp. 306; cloth \$28.45)

Speaking of the art of literary criticism in 'John Galsworthy', D.H. Lawrence declared in 1926 that 'we judge a work of art by its effect on our sincere and vital emotion, and nothing else'. This suggests that moral standards in the critic are based on a 'correspondence', or to use Lawrence's phrase a 'trembling balance' between himself and the text. This, of course was how Lawrence knew Man's conscious and unconscious feelings and could describe them. But without knowing it, Lawrence had also outlined a modern, even unprecedented psychoanalytical approach to textual reading. Now James Cowan takes up the challenge of formalizing it in the light of psychoanalysis.

Professor Cowan studies the theme of 'the trembling balance' in relation to the domains of self psychology and the analytic cure. He draws our attention to the notions of 'ego boundaries' and 'projections', to the 'projective identification' that is involved in communicating, and 'imaginative empathy' which is derived from it. James Cowan goes on to demonstrate how textual reading shares the same characteristics, drawing upon the examples of Joseph Sandler, Heinz Kohut, and Norman Holland.

Admittedly, the first two chapters of Cowan's book are difficult to read. They are, to use his phrase 'the unpoetic language of interactional communication'. But each term gives evidence of 'the secret alliance' between the author and his reader. When Cowan turns to *Studies in Classic American Literature*, he can see Lawrence's notions of 'the true artist' and 'true art speech' from Lawrence's identification with Melville.

The trembling balance is not only, according to Cowan 'a figure for health in the self and in the self's relationship to the external environment'; it is also a metaphor for a physiological phenomenon. Apparently, Lawrence was aware of Walter Cannon's theory of physiological homeostasis when he wrote *Psychoanalysis and the Unconscious* and *Fantasia of the Unconscious*. And he had possibly read Gray's *Anatomy of the Human Body*. Cowan's overall thesis,

in keeping with Lawrence's own in his two essays, is that sensory perceptions, such as in sex, form the basis of visionary experiences which can lead to psychological readjustments, and developmental changes. Along these lines, Cowan examines several of Lawrence's stories: 'The Blind Man', 'The Thorn in the Flesh', and 'You Touched Me'. Visionary experiences in *Lady Chatterley's Lover* are also compared with James Joyce's 'epiphanies'.

Any system concerned with process or creative change rather than any specific field of knowledge interested Lawrence. A myth or a literary tale could also appear as theoretical substratum or thematic structure to his plots. In this respect, Cowan examines the phoenix symbol and the principles of alchemy in *The Plumed Serpent*, pagan and Christian myths in 'The Escaped Cock', the symptoms of a phobia in 'The Thorn in the Flesh', and the influence of Nietzsche's Dionysian and Apollonian systems on 'The Ladybird'. Cowan thinks that Dionys stands for the Dionysian at one end of the spectrum of destruction, whilst Roderick Usher, one of Poe's characters who resurfaces through Dionys's speech, stands for the Apollonian, at the other end of the spectrum. Both figures of destruction, Dionys nevertheless represents a kind of freeing power.

It is regrettable that James Cowan did not have the space to discuss the successive versions of Lawrence's texts in relation to textual reading and imaginative empathy. As Keith Cushman remarked in *D.H. Lawrence at Work: The Emergence of the Prussian Officer Stories* 'to Lawrence, writing was both process and act of discovery'. Cowan sees the text instead as 'a synthesis of the author's experience'.

The benefit of Cowan's viewpoint allows writing to assume the same therapeutic function as when Lawrence said 'one sheds ones sicknesses in books – repeats and presents again ones emotions, to be master of them'. Cowan also suggests that Lawrence's insight into human relations placed him ahead of the next two generations of psychoanalytic thinkers. In his lifetime, only *Sons and Lovers* was accepted as a psychoanalytic novel.

Fabienne Blakey

Books Received

Winifred J. Mustoe, *Pilgrimage of Discovery: a Centenary Essay on John Middleton Murry* (privately printed, 1990; pp. 49; no price given). The author of this extended essay was for many years an extra-mural student, and after retirement she went on to take a degree in English as a mature student at Birmingham University. The pamphlet covers all phases of Murry's career and includes a full bibliography of works by and about him. Of *Son of Woman* Miss Mustoe concludes 'it is not a critical work, but rather a psychological study of another hero'.

L. S Ramaiah and Sachidananda Mohanty, *D. H. Lawrence Studies in India: a Bibliographical Guide with a Review Essay* (Calcutta: Writers Workshop, 1990; pp. 91; cloth Rs 100). As Lawrence studies increase throughout the world it is vital that we have some idea of how he is read and how his reputation stands in different countries. This bibliography is the first devoted to Lawrence studies in India and covers research dissertations as well as books and journal articles. Analysing the appeal of Lawrence to Indian readers, the authors remark that 'a society that is increasingly rebelling against the stranglehold of the past must naturally turn to a prophet like Lawrence who signifies an alternative vision of Man. It is a world view that sees not dualism or exclusivism but a wholesome balance governing human existence'. In an interesting prefatory essay, Dennis Jackson, editor of the *D. H. Lawrence Review* offers a western view on the Indian contribution to our understanding of Lawrence.

***Japan D.H. Lawrence Studies No. 1* (D.H. Lawrence Society of Japan, 1991).** The issue contains: 'The Poetry of D. H. Lawrence: Defamiliarisation and Foregrounding' by Masaaki Yasuo (in Japanese with English synopsis) 'Lawrence's Liquid Lexicon and Siegmund's Heart in *The Trespasser*' by Dennis Hoerner (in English); Mitsuru Mashiguchi's bibliography of Lawrence translations in Japan, 1921-26; and Yuichi Okayama's survey of new books on Lawrence in 1990 (both in Japanese). There is also material on the meetings and membership of the Japanese Lawrence Society.

Anja Viinikka, *From Persephone to Pan: D. H. Lawrence's Mythopoeic Vision of the Integrated Personality* (Turku, Finland: Annales Universitatis Turku, 1988; pp. 243; paper, no price given). Anja Viinikka's study gives special emphasis to the short fiction and other writings of the early 1920s and sets Lawrence's work in the context of a wide variety of theories about the nature and use of myth. In the case of Lawrence's work, she argues that myth penetrates at every level: in characterisation, social comment, the creation of